



PROJECT DIRECTORATE
PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION UNIT - SIAPEP
Sindh Seed Corporation Building, Ground Floor, Main Hussainabad Road, Hussainabad Hyderabad
Tel: 022-9260251 - 9260252 Fax : 022-9260062



Assessment Report for Selection of Internal Audit Firms Under SIAPEP

Internal Audit Services for the Period covering January 2020 to December 2021

S. No.	Criteria	Marks	Name of Firms		
			BDO Ebrahim & Co.	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	EY Ford Rhodes
1	A chartered accountancy firm registered for last ten years.	Must	<u>Complied</u> The firm became part of the BDO network in 1982	<u>Complied</u> The firm was registered in 1981	<u>Complied</u> The firm was registered in 2009
2	A Satisfactory rating under the Quality Control Review program	Must	<u>Complied</u> The firm's rating is satisfactory under the Quality Control Review Program	<u>Complied</u> The firm's rating is satisfactory under the Quality Control Review Program	<u>Complied</u> The firm's rating is satisfactory under the Quality Control Review Program
3	State Bank of Pakistan's Panel of Auditors under not less than Category 'A'	Must	<u>Complied</u> The firm is listed in A category in State Bank of Pakistan's Panel	<u>Complied</u> The firm is listed in A category in State Bank of Pakistan's Panel	<u>Complied</u> The firm is listed in A category in State Bank of Pakistan's Panel

[Signature]
24/11/21

[Signature]
24/11/21

S. No.	Criteria	Marks	Name of Firms		
			BDO Ebrahim & Co.	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	EY Ford Rhodes
4	Experience of carrying out minimum 3 similar engagements during last 5 years in Pakistan.		<u>35</u>	<u>45</u>	<u>55</u>
	Similar Engagements:				
	• Performed Min 3 Internal Audit /Risk Assessment Services (RAS) Services		The firm has provided four Similar Engagements as under: * Quaid E Azam Thermal Power Organization Limited (2019-2022)	* Capacity Building Support to Asian Development Bank – 2016 USD 450,000 (Under this engagement, KPMGTH was appointed to Work with executing agencies to building their capacity in Financial Management during implementation of ADB Financed Projects)	* Internal Audit of SIAPEP - 2019 (IA of Public Sector Project Funded by WB) (PKR 7,251,676/=)
	• Internal Audit / Risk Assessment Services (RAS) in Public Sector Development Project		* Punjab Thermal Power Private Limited (2017-Present)		* Internal Audit of SAGP (IA of Public Sector Project Funded by WB) (PKR 7,573,396/=) (The firm is providing the services currently)
4	• Internal Audit / Risk Assessment Services (RAS) in Public Sector Development Projects funded by World Bank / ADB	60	* Virtual University of Pakistan (2020)	* Financial Review of Sindh Community Mobilization Program (2017) funded by USAID PKR 2,000,000 (RAS of Public Sector Entity)	* Internal Audit of BIWRMDP- (IA of Public Sector Project Funded by WB) (PKR 13,907,275/=) (The firm is providing the services currently)
			* Sindh Healthcare Commission (2018)	* Internal Audit of School Construction & Punjab Education Sector Program funded by DFID – 2016 (Internal Audit of Public Sector Entity)- PKR 2,000,000	* Internal Audit of Balochistan Nutrition program for the Mothers and children (BNPMC-Funded by World Bank- 2017) (PKR 4,200,000/=)

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

					<p>* Audit of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa- School Construction and Rehabilitation Program (KP-SCRP-DFID) (GDP-22,000) (The firm is providing the services currently)</p> <p>* Internal Audit-Risk of PPP Node Health department GoS- 2020) (ADB/Health - PKR 2,945,000)</p> <p>* Public Financial Management Risk Assessment (PFMRA) Government of Pakistan Entities (24 Government entities throughout Pakistan)- Donor Funded -US INL (2017) (USD 1,363,408)</p>
S. No.	Criteria	Marks	Name of Firms		
			BDO Ebrahim & Co.	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	EY Ford Rhodes
5	They should have adequate number of professionals consistent with tasks delineated in ToRs and well-equipped office.	40	<p>The Firm has: 2 qualified Chartered Accountants (Managing Partner and a Partner)</p> <p><u>30</u></p>	<p>The firm has a strength of 1,537 staff members with more than 100 Chartered</p> <p><u>40</u></p>	<p>The firm has a strength of 1400+ professionals including 29 partners.</p> <p><u>40</u></p>

[Signature]

[Signature]

		1 ACCA working as Director	Accountants, 200 ACCAs and several members of ICMAP	EYFR has 352 CAs / ACMAs / CIMAs / ACCAs
Total Marks	100	65	85	95

Both KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co and EY Ford Rhodes are amongst the big four audit firms. Their documents clearly depict the proven capacity of doing the overall audits, internal audits, capacity building, financial reviews, professional service agreements etc., however considering of SIAPEP requirements EY Ford Rhodes has emerged as top ranked firms keeping in view of following:

- As per the requirements of TORs, firm has done more similar types of engagements in Pakistan during the last five years.
- The firm has carried out more internal audit of the World Bank funded projects during the last five years.
- Their Karachi office is well equipped in terms of human resource.

Detailed Summary of Firm's past experience of carrying of overall audits during the last five (05) years is attached – (Annex A)

Detailed Summary of Firm's over all human resource showing the strength and staff deployed at Karachi is attached – (Annex B)

Signed by Convener and Evaluation Committee Members:


Badaruddin Mahar,

Deputy Director (Admin) On Farm Water
Management,
Hyderabad Sindh/Convener


Engr. Mirza Zulkefal,


Core Office, PSIA,
Hyderabad/Member


Mr. Zulfiqar Ali Effendi,

Environment & Social Monitoring
Specialist, M&EC Hyderabad/Member

✓
Approved / Not Approved

PD - SIAPEP


5/4/2021

Summary of Firm's past experience of carrying of overall audits during the last five (05) years

Annex - A

Name of Firms	
KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	EY Ford Rhodes
i. Monitoring & Evaluation Services to UNICEF GPE Program, Afghanistan (2012-2017) USD 250,000	i. Internal Audit of Sindh Irrigated Agricultural Productivity Enhancement Project (SIAPEP) World Bank Funded (2016-2019) PKR 7,251,676
ii. Audit of 58 UNHCR-funded Project (2014-2017) PKR 18,000,000	ii. Internal Audit of Sindh Agriculture Growth Project. World Bank Funded (2015-2021) PKR 7,573,396
iii. Audit of 68 Projects UNHCR (2015-2016) PKR 22,000,000	iii. Internal Audit of Balochistan Integrated Water Recourses Management & Development Project (BIWRMDP) World Bank Funded (2017-2021) PKR 13,907,275
iv. Capacity building support to Asian Development Bank (ADB) (2015-2016) USD 450,000	iv. Internal Audit Risk- Agha Khan University Hospital (2018-2020) PKR 4,334,000
v. Independent Audit of PSI/Greenstar (DFID) (2012-2016) USD 75,000	v. Internal Audit of Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Human Resources Research & Development Board (BBSHRADB) World Bank Funded (2015-2017) PKR 2,678,452
vi. Independent Audit of Marie Stopes International (MSI) Marie Stopes Society (MSS) (DFID) (2012-2016) USD 75,000	vi. Internal Audit of Balochistan Nutrition program for the Mothers & Children (BNPMC) World Bank Funded (2017-2019) PKR 4,200,000
vii. Independent Audit of DKT (DFID) (2014-2016) USD 75,000	vii. Audit of KPK School Construction & Rehabilitation Program (KP - SCRP) DFIP (2020 - ongoing) GBP 22,000
viii. Independent Audit of Palladium (previously known as GRM Future) (DFID) (2014-2018) USD 75,000	viii. Internal Audit of Punjab Education Foundation (Govt. of Punjab) (2014-2016) PKR 800,000
ix. Independent Audit of Mott Macdonald Limited (DFID) (2014-2018) USD 75,000	
x. Internal Audit for School Construction & Rehabilitation Components for Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & Punjab Education Sector Programs funded by DFID (2015-2016) PKR 2,000,000	
xi. Internal Audit Siyah Kalem Construction Company Limited (2012-2016)	

[Handwritten signatures and initials]

xii. Internal Audit of various projects of the Fauji Foundation (2010-2016)

- ix. Internal Audit of Quid e Azam Solar Power Company (pvt.) Ltd. (Govt. funded) (2014-2016)
- x. Internal Audits – Risk PPP Node, ADB- Health Department Gos (2019-2020) PKR 2,945,000
- xi. Internal Audit services Balochistan Institute of Nephro-Urology Quetta (BINUQ) (2015-2019) PKR 4,334,000
- xii. Internal Audit Framework & Internal Audit of Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Human Resources and Development Board (BBSHRADB) Gos (2016-2017) PKR 2,678,452
- xiii. Public Financial Management Risk Assessment (PFMRA) Donor Funded – US INL (2016-2017) USD 1,363,408
- xiv. Financial Management Capacity Assessment of the over 200 Government Department & Entities on behalf of UN Agencies in Pakistan. (2010 to ongoing) PKR 69,750,000
- xv. Local Government & Rural Development, KPK (under UNICEF)- 2016
- xvi. WASTAN Cell, Local Government & Rural Development, (under UNICEF) (2016)
- xvii. Women Development Department (under UNICEF) (2016)
- xviii. Planning & Development Department, Govt. of Balochistan (under UNICEF) (2016)
- xix. Planning & Development Department, Govt. of Gilgit (under UNICEF) (2016)
- xx. National Commission for Human Development (under UNICEF) (2016)

xxi.	Housing Urban Development & Public Health Engineering Department (HUD & PHED) (under UNICEF)- 2018
xxii.	Planning & Development Department, Govt. of KPK (under UNICEF) (2018)
xxiii.	Planning & Development Department, Govt. of Balochistan (under UNICEF) (2018)
xxiv.	Additional Director Development TE & SE KPK (under UNICEF) (2019)
xxv.	Planning & Development Department, Govt. of KPK (under UNDP) (2019)
xxvi.	Local Government & Community Development Department (under UNICEF) (2019)
xxvii.	Small & Medium Enterprises Development Authority (SMEDA) KPK (under UNDP) (2019)
xxviii.	Scaling Up Nutrition (SUN) unit, Planning & Development Department Govt of Gilgit (under UNICEF) (2020)
xxix.	Review of Disbursement Linked indicator (DLI's) Planning & Development, Task force Secretariat Sindh Enhancement Response to Reduce Stunting (Health / World Bank) (2020) PKR 5,276,648
xxx.	Review of Disbursement Linked indicator (DLI's) Finance Division GoP, WB Funded (2019-2021) PKR 11,951.861
xxxi.	Review of Disbursement Linked indicator (DLI's) Economic Reform Unit, Finance Department GOS, (WB Funded) (2017-2020)


Abdul Wahid


Asim

	xxxii.	Strengthening Financial Management System of EPI (World Bank) (2019-2020)
	xxxiii.	Review of Program Development Objectives and Disbursement Linked Indicator (DLI's) for Strengthening Markets for Agriculture & Rural Transformation (SMART) Punjab Program, (World Bank) (2018 – ongoing) USD 42,500
	xxxiv.	Review of Program Development Objectives (PDOs) and Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) for job and Competitiveness (J&C) (World Bank) (2018 ongoing) USD 19,000
	xxxv.	Review of Procurement Timelines and Efficiencies in Specified Departments of GoS (WB) (2018-2019) PKR 6,300,000
	xxxvi.	Review Civil Work and livelihoods activities under CR&SLP including the construction of Schools (UNDP)- 2018
	xxxvii.	Impact assessment of Refugee affected Hosting Area (RAHA) Initiative (UNHCR) (2017-2018) PKR 13,000,000
	xxxviii.	Development Training Modules in Alignment with SPPRA Training Strategy & Review and Preparing Procurement Guidelines for Government of Sindh (World Bank) (2017-2019) PKR 7,800,000
Similar Engagements during last five (5) years in Pakistan.		
KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.		EY Ford Rhodes
* Capacity Building Support to Asian Development Bank –2016 USD 450,0000	* Internal	Audit of SIAPEP -2019 (IA of Public Sector Project Funded by WB) (PKR 7,251,676/=)

[Signature] *[Signature]* *[Signature]*

Summary of Firm's over all human resource showing the strength, staff deployed at Karachi and relevant skill set and experience for SIAPEP

BDO Ebrahim & Co.	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	EY Ford Rhodes	
<u>A Summary of firm's human resource showing the strength</u>			
80,087+ highly skilled partners and staff worldwide Fifth (5 th) largest network in worldwide	Partners	Partners/Principal	29
	Executive Directors (Partner Equivalent)	Executive Directors	06
	Directors	Senior Directors	15
	Senior Managers	Directors	17
	Managers	Senior Managers	23
	Senior Associates/Senior Team Member	Executive Managers	33
	Associates/Team Members	Managers	96
	Infrastructure Staff	Assistant Managers	76
		Supervising Executives	86
		Seniors	535
		Consultant/Analyst/Associate	463
		Client Serving Contractor	04
		Core Business Support	102
	Total Staff	Total Staff	1485

BDO Ebrahim & Co.		KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.		EY Ford Rhodes	
<u>A Summary of firm's human resource deployed at Karachi office</u>					
400+ employees deputed at Karachi, Lahore, Islamabad and Kabul offices	Partners	03	Total Staff of firm's human resource deployed at Karachi 861		
	Directors/ Senior Managers	03			
	Managers	05			
	AM/DM	11			
	Supervisory Senior	04			
	Other Staff	35			
Total Staff	61				

BDO Ebrahim & Co.		KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.		EY Ford Rhodes	
<u>Summary of Proposed Team by Firm's with relevant skill set and experience for SIAPEP</u>					
<u>Name of Staff</u>	<u>Position Assigned</u>	<u>Name of Staff</u>	<u>Position Assigned</u>	<u>Name of Staff</u>	<u>Position Assigned</u>
Zulfiqar Causer	Engagement Partner	Syed Najmul Shah	Engagement Partner	Kamran Shahid	Partner -EYFR
Haziq Neshat	Engagement Director	Rizwan Ali	Senior Manager	Abbas Ali	Engagement Partner
Manager- TBD	Manager (Full time)	Ameet Kumar Dewani	Engagement Partner	Ali Akbar	Project Manager
Two Positions- TBD	Supervisor (Full Time)	Support Staff	Supervisor/Senior Associates	Khuram Shazad	Senior Manager
Three Positions- TBD	Engagement Team (Full Time)			Abid Shabbir	Field Manager
				Arbab Gul Muhammad	Team Member


Zulfiqar Causer


Kamran Shahid